

# **CARROLL INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT**

## **REPORT ON THE STATUS OF THE BAND INSTRUMENT INVENTORY**

**March, 16, 2012**

**Jerry Longwell, Consultant**

The Band Program of the Carroll ISD has a hard-earned and well-deserved reputation for excellence. The classroom instruction band students receive is excellent and is a valuable part of their total academic experience. Their high level of achievement is seen in the public performance of the bands which are a source of great pride for the entire school district. This success has only been possible because of the hard work, talent and dedication of many students, teachers and administrators, under the leadership of the Board of Education, and with the continuous support of parents and members of the community.

The Band Program has experienced significant growth over the past 30 years, both from the addition of new schools and from increasing band enrollment in existing schools. Throughout this period, funds for the purchase of band instruments have been devoted to adding instruments to keep up with growth when new campuses were opened. No program was developed to keep up with growth within the programs and no program was developed for the replacement of band instruments that had outlived their usefulness.

It should be noted that all students who play school-owned instrument are required to pay a Band Instrument Usage fee. The annual fee is \$150.00 for high school students and is \$150.00 for intermediate and middle school students. The fee is increased to \$200.00 for students who play one instrument in marching band and a different instrument in concert band. In addition to these fees, all high school students pay a band fee of \$385.00 per year. All of the instrument usage fees are used for the repair and maintenance of the existing band instrument inventory.

A growing percentage of the current band instrument inventory is of poor quality, including some instruments that are no longer usable. Larger and larger amounts of budgeted funds are required for repair of these instruments, but there is a limit to the cost effectiveness of that practice. In the absence of budgeted funds for the purchase of additional or replacement instruments, the Band Booster Club has been called upon to provide these funds. Although the Band Booster Club has been exceptionally generous in the support of these programs, the need for funds has grown beyond their ability to provide them.



The teachers have found ways to work around these problems. Newer instruments are sometimes shared by two or more students, instruments are transferred between schools, parents are asked to provide a new instrument for their child, and poor quality instruments are used well beyond their normally useful life. These practices are tenable for some period of time, but sooner or later the deteriorating condition of the instruments will have a negative impact upon classroom instruction and upon the quality of the performance of the bands. In the classroom, teachers and students are increasingly frustrated with attempts to work around the problem and the public will soon begin to notice a change in the quality of performance.

Two steps are recommended to solve the current problem and to prevent a future recurrence;

**(1) Adopt and implement a policy to replace all instruments that have outlived their usefulness.**

Replacements can be divided into three categories over a period of ten years. The Immediate Replacements will require an allocation of \$1,000,000 at the present time, followed by a five year period of \$150,000 per year for Short-Term Replacements, followed by a second 5 year period of \$100,000 per year for Long-Term Replacements.

**(2) Adopt a schedule for the timely replacement of instruments when they reach their useful life expectancy.**

Following the 10-year period outlined in (1) above, the Replacement Schedule described on the attached pages should be followed in order to prevent a recurrence of this problem and to ensure that the quality of music education available to CISD students is not limited by worn out and unplayable instruments. It is estimated that an annual allocation of \$200,000 to \$250,000 will be needed to maintain this schedule.

## **CARROLL INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT**

### **BAND INSTRUMENT REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE**

Several years ago, the University of Texas confronted a problem almost identical with that encountered by the Carroll ISD Band Program today. No replacement policy had ever been adopted and they were faced with an accumulation of older instruments that were either not playable or in such poor condition that their continued use would mean lower quality instruction and performance. To solve this problem, they implemented a program to replace the older instruments and also developed a policy for the future replacement of instruments as they reached their useful life expectancy.

According to Jerry Junkin, Director of Bands at the University of Texas, this plan has achieved its objective, allowing them to maintain better quality instruments with lower annual outlays for new instruments. It has had the effect of leveling out expenditures and making them more predictable. The University of Texas plan has also been adopted in at least two other states, Florida and Michigan, based upon the positive results in Texas. Locally, the Birdville Independent School District used the Texas plan as the basis for the adoption of their Band Instrument Replacement Policy in 2004.

Mr. LaVerne Buckton, with the cooperation of a number of band instrument manufacturers, completed the original study and developed the data upon which the University of Texas built its policy. The Buckton study found that most instruments lose approximately 25% of their value in the first year, about 10% during each of the next four years and about 7% for each year after the fifth. This research was done in a Mid-Western state several years ago, however, therefore adjustments were made in the Texas recommendations, taking into account the Texas climate and the improvement in the quality of instruments manufactured in recent years. In every case, any adjustment made was in favor of a longer life expectancy, not a shorter one.

Although the Texas recommendations are based on valid criteria, it should be noted that the actual life span of a given instrument will be affected by how it is used and cared for. For example, an instrument used outside during marching season as well as inside during concert season, may not last as long as one that is used only inside. Therefore, the attached schedule should be viewed as providing the ages at which an instrument will be eligible for replacement, with the understanding that both later and earlier replacements might be called for under special circumstances.

As noted in the "Report on the Status of the Band Instrument Inventory" document, it is necessary to bring the current inventory up to date as the first step in implementing this policy. After that is done, this schedule should be followed.

The following page, titled "Probable Life of Band Instruments," shows the plan adopted at the University of Texas and also in the Birdville ISD. It is recommended that the CISD Band Program adopt an identical schedule.

## PROBABLE LIFE OF BAND INSTRUMENTS

### CARROLL INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>PROBABLE LIFE IN YEARS</u>
Piccolo	9
Oboe	10
English Horn	11
Bassoon	11
Eb Soprano Clarinet	9
Alto Clarinet	9
Bass Clarinet	9
Contra Bass Clarinet	10
Tenor Saxophone	10
Baritone Saxophone	10
French Horn	9
Marching French Horn	9
Bass Trombone	9
Euphonium	9
Marching Euphonium	9
Tuba	10
Sousaphone	9
Snare Drums	8
Bass Drums	8
Tympani	12
Orchestra Bells	12
Chimes	12
Marimba	8
Xylophone	8
Vibraphone	10

NOTE: Equipment such as small percussion instruments, cymbals, electronic tuners, electronic metronomes, recording and playback equipment, and PA System has not been included on the above list because of the specialized nature of those items and the wide variance in their useful life expectancy. Each of these items will be considered for replacement individually on an "as needed" basis.

## CISD

### ADDITIONAL NOTES FOR REPLACEMENT POLICY

1. Life Expectancy for instruments categorized as "Specialty Instruments" will need to be adjusted on an individual basis due to their more limited use. These instruments may be used only for certain repertoire and specific ensembles. This category includes Alto Flute, Bass Flute, English Horn, Eb Soprano Clarinet, Contra Clarinet, Soprano Saxophone, Flugelhorn, and Bass Trombone
2. Note that at one time the Carroll High School and Carroll Senior High School had separate band instrument inventories, including a full complement of percussion instruments at each school. When all band activities were moved to Carroll High School the two inventories were combined, creating some excess instruments. The life expectancy of some of these instruments may be extended due to more limited use.
3. The current percussion inventory is in good condition and quality for current needs. Like "Specialty Instruments," percussion instruments will need to be replaced on an "as needed" basis, depending on year-by-year assessments. Marching Band percussion is subject to more rigorous use and may have a shorter life expectancy than concert instruments.
4. The current inventory includes three categories of instruments:
  - a. Instruments that are beyond life expectancy, in some cases by several years, and need to be replaced now or removed from the inventory.
  - b. Instruments that are still usable but are nearing the end of their useful life and need to be scheduled for replacement in one to five years.
  - c. Instruments that are newer and are in good to excellent condition and will need to be replaced in six to ten years.
5. Instruments used in both Marching Band and Concert Band could be expected to have a shorter life span.
6. Instruments used only in Marching Band may have a shorter life span due to weather exposure and higher risk of minor damage.
7. Instruments used only in Concert Band may have a longer life span.

**CISD**

**CARROLL HIGH SCHOOL REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE**

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>REPLACE/ADD NOW</u>	<u>REPLACE 1-5 YEARS</u>	<u>REPLACE 6-10 YEARS</u>	<u>BRAND/ MODEL</u>
Piccolo	0	5	4	Haynes HAPI
	4	0	0	Yamaha YPC32
Oboe	2	8	4	Loree AK3
Bassoon	0	7	3	Fox 240
Bass Clarinet	1	11	5	Buffet BC119320
	4	0	0	Selmer 1430P
Tenor Sax	0	5	8	YamahaYTS62
	0	0	7	Buffet 400(BC840210)
Baritone Sax	0	8	1	Yamaha YBS 52
	2	0	0	Buffet 400(BC840310)
French Horn	19	0	11	Conn 8D
Euphonium	0	13	2	Sterling Virtuoso
Marching Bar.	0	15	0	King 1124SP
Tuba	3	0	0	Miraphone1291BB
	7	0	10	Miraphone 186S
Bb Mellophone	0	20	0	King 1121SP
Sousphone	18	0	2	Conn 20K Bright Silver

Specialty instruments (English Horn, Eb Soprano Clarinet, Contra Clarinet, Soprano Saxophone, and Bass Trombone) will be replaced as needed.

No percussion replacements or additions now, but replacements will be made as needed.

CISD

CARROLL MIDDLE SCHOOL REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>REPLACE/ADD NOW</u>	<u>REPLACE/ADD 1-5 YEARS</u>	<u>REPLACE 6-10 YEARS</u>	<u>BRAND/ MODEL</u>
Piccolo	2	3	0	Yamaha YPC82
Oboe	2	0	0	Loree AK3
	6	1	0	Fox330
Bassoon	2	0	0	Fox 240
	4	2	0	Fox 222
Bass Clarinet	7	7	0	Yamaha YCL221-II
Tenor Saxophone 400(BC840210)	5	5	0	Buffet
Baritone Saxophone	0	1	0	Yamaha YBS52
	0	4	0	Buffet 00(BC840310)
French Horn	15	0	0	Conn 8D
Euphonium	2	0	0	Sterling Virtuoso
	1	11	0	Yamaha YEP321s
Tuba	3	0	0	Miraphone 186S
	9	0	0	King 2341W



CISD

DAWSON MIDDLE SCHOOL REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>REPLACE NOW</u>	<u>REPLACE 1-5YEARS</u>	<u>REPLACE 6-10 YEARS</u>	<u>BRAND/MODEL</u>
Piccolo	0	0	2	Yamaha YPC82
Oboe	2	0	0	Loree AK3
	6	0	0	Fox 330
Bassoon	2	0	0	Fox 240
	4	2	0	Fox 222
Bass Clarinet	3	3	0	Yamaha YCL 221-II
Tenor Saxophone	5	0	0	Buffet 400(BC840210)
Bari. Saxophone	1	0	0	Yamaha YBS52
	2	0	0	Buffet 400(BC840310)
French Horn	6	0	9	Han Hoyer 6802NSA-L
Euphonium	2	0	0	Sterling Virtuoso
	10	0	0	Yamaha YEP321s
Tuba	3	0	0	Miraphone 186S
	0	6	3	King 2341W

CISD

DURHAM INTERMEDIATE SCHOOL REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>REPLACE/ADD NOW</u>	<u>REPLACE/ADD 1-5 YEARS</u>	<u>REPLACE 6-10 YEARS</u>	<u>BRAND/ MODEL</u>
Oboe	6	0	0	Fox Renard 333
Bassoon	6	0	0	Fox Renard 41
Bass Clarinet	4	0	0	Yamaha YCL221-II
Tenor Saxophone 100(BC810110)	0	5	0	Buffet
Baritone Sax. 400(BC840310)	2	0	0	Buffet
French Horn	15	0	0	Yamaha YHR567
Euphonium	12	0	0	Yamaha YEP321s
Tuba	10	0	0	Jupiter 482/4valve

CISD

EUBANKS INTERMEDIATE SCHOOL REPLACEMENT SCHEDULE

<u>INSTRUMENT</u>	<u>REPLACE NOW</u>	<u>REPLACE 1-5 YEARS</u>	<u>REPLACE 6-10 YEARS</u>	<u>BRAND/MODEL</u>
Oboe	6	-0-	-0-	Fox Renard 333
Bassoon	6	-0-	-0-	Fox Renard 41
Bass Clarinet	4	-0-	-0-	Yamaha YCL221-II
Tenor Saxophone	-0-	3	2	Buffet 100(BC810110)
Bari. Saxophone	-0-	1	1	Buffet 100(BC840310)
French Horn	8	8	-0-	Yamaha YHR567
Euphonium	12	-0-	-0-	Yamaha YEP321s
Tuba	10	-0-	-0-	Jupiter 482/4 valve

**CISD**  
**Summary of Instruments to be Replaced/Added Now**

<u>Instrument</u>	<u>CHS</u>	<u>CMC</u>	<u>DMS</u>	<u>DIS</u>	<u>EIS</u>	<u>TOTAL</u>
<b><u>Piccolo</u></b>						
Haynes HAPI						0
Yamaha YPC82		2				2
Yamaha YPC32	4					4
<b><u>Oboe</u></b>						
Loree AK3	2	2	2			6
Fox 330		6	6			12
Fox Renard 333				6	6	12
<b><u>Bassoon</u></b>						
Fox 240		2	2			4
Fox 222		4	4			8
Fox Renard 41				6	6	12
<b><u>Bass Clarinet</u></b>						
Buffet BC119320	1					1
Yamaha YCL221-II		7	3	4	4	18
Selmer 1430P	4					4
<b><u>Tenor Saxophone</u></b>						
Yamaha YTS62						
Buffet BC840201		5	5			10
Buffet BC810110						
<b><u>Baritone Saxophone</u></b>						
Yamaha YBS52			1			1
Buffet BC840310	2		2	2		6

**Replacements Now, p.2**

<b><u>Instrument</u></b>	<b><u>CHS</u></b>	<b><u>CMS</u></b>	<b><u>DMS</u></b>	<b><u>DIS</u></b>	<b><u>EIS</u></b>	<b><u>TOTAL</u></b>
<b><u>French Horn</u></b>						
Conn 8D	19	15				34
Hans Hoyer 6802NSAL			6			6
Yamaha YHR567				15	8	23
<b><u>Mellophone</u></b>						
King 1121						0
<b><u>Euphonium</u></b>						
Berling Virtuoso		2	2			3
Yamaha YEP 321s		1	10	12	12	35
<b><u>Marching Baritone</u></b>						
King 1124SP						0
<b><u>Tuba</u></b>						
Miraphone 1291BB	3					3
Miraphone 186S	7	3	3			13
King 2341 W		9				9
Jupiter 482L				10	10	20
<b><u>Sousaphone</u></b>						
Conn 20K Bright Silver	18					18

CISD

SUMMARY OF INSTRUMENTS TO BE REPLACED/ADDED YEARS 1-5

<u>Instrument</u>	<u>CHS</u>	<u>CMC</u>	<u>DMS</u>	<u>DIS</u>	<u>EIS</u>	<u>Total</u>
<b><u>Piccolo</u></b>						
Haynes HAPI	5					5
Yamaha YPC82		3				3
Yamaha YPC32				0		0
<b><u>Oboe</u></b>						
Loree AK3	8					8
Fox 330		1				1
Fox Renard 333						0
<b><u>Bassoon</u></b>						
Fox 240	7					7
Fox 222		2	2			4
Fox Renard 41						0
<b><u>Bass Clarinet</u></b>						
Buffet BC 119320	11					11
Yamaha YCL221-II		7	3		0	10
Selmer 1430LP						0
<b><u>Tenor Saxophone</u></b>						
Yamaha YTS62	5					5
Buffet BC840210		5				5
Buffet BC810110				5	3	8
<b><u>Baritone Saxophone</u></b>						
Yamaha YBS52	8	1				9
Buffet BC840310		4			1	5

Replace 1-5, p. 2

<b>Instrument</b>	<b>M.B.</b>	<b><u>CHS</u></b>	<b><u>CMS</u></b>	<b><u>DMS</u></b>	<b><u>DIS</u></b>	<b><u>EIS</u></b>	<b><u>TOTAL</u></b>
<b><u>French Horn</u></b>							
Hans Hoyer 6802NSA-L							0
Conn 8D			0				0
Yamaha YHR567						8	8
<b><u>Mellophone</u></b>							
King 1121		20					20
<b><u>Euphonium</u></b>							
Sterling Virtuoso		13					13
Yamaha YEP 321s			11				11
<b><u>Marching Baritone</u></b>							
hg 1124SP		15					15
<b><u>Tuba</u></b>							
Mirphone 1291BB							0
Miraphone 186S							0
King 2341W				6			6
Jupiter 482L							0

CISD

SUMMARY OF INSTRUMENTS TO BE REPLACED IN YEARS 6-10

<u>Instrument</u> <u>Total</u>	<u>CHS</u>	<u>CMC</u>	<u>DMS</u>	<u>DIS</u>	<u>EIS</u>
<b><u>Piccolo</u></b>					
Haynes HAPI 4	4				
Yamaha YPC82 2			2		
Yamaha YPC32 0					
<b><u>Oboe</u></b>					
Loree AK3 4	4				
Fox 330 0					
Fox Renard 333 0					
<b><u>Bassoon</u></b>					
Fox 240 3	3				
Fox 222 0					
Fox Renard 41 0					
<b><u>Bass Clarinet</u></b>					
Buffet BC 119320 5	5				
Yamaha YCL221-II 0					0



Selmer 1430LP

0

**Alto Saxophone**

Yamaha YTS62 8

8

Buffet BC840210 7

7

Buffet BC810110 2

2

**Baritone Saxophone**

Yamaha YBS52 1

1

Buffet BC840310 1

1

placements, years 6-10, p.2

<u>Instrument</u>	<u>M.B.</u>	<u>CHS</u>	<u>CMS</u>	<u>DMS</u>	<u>DIS</u>	<u>EIS</u>	<u>Total</u>
-------------------	-------------	------------	------------	------------	------------	------------	--------------

**French Horn**

Conn 8D 11 11

Hans Hoyer 6802NSA-L 9 9

Yamaha YHR567 0

**Mellophone**

King 1121SP 0

**Euphonium**

King Virtuoso 2 2

Yamaha YEP321s 0

**Marching Baritone**

King 1124SP 0

**Tuba**

Miraphone 1291BB	0	0
Miraphone 186S	10	10
King 2341W		3
Jupiter 482L		0

**Sousaphone**

Conn 20KSBW	2	0
-------------	---	---

**CISD**

**COST ESTIMATES FOR REPLACEMENTS/ADDITIONS FOR ALL SCHOOLS**

<u>INSTRUMENT/COST</u>	<u>NOW</u>	<u>1-5</u>	<u>6-10</u>
<b>Piccolo</b>			
Haynes HAPI/\$6,000	0 = \$ 0	5 = \$30,000	4 = \$24,000
Yamaha YPC82/\$3,000	2 = \$ 6,000	3 = \$ 9,000	2 = \$ 6,000
Yamaha YPC32/\$1,200	4 = \$ 4,800	0 = 0	0 = 0
<b>Oboe</b>			
Loree AK3/\$6,300	6 = \$ 37,800	8 = \$50,400	4 = \$25,200
Fox 330/\$2,600	12 = \$ 31,200	1 = \$ 2,600	0 = 0
Fox Renard 333/\$2,600	12 = \$ 31,200	0 = 0	0 = 0
<b>Bassoon</b>			
Fox 240/\$7,900	4 = \$ 31,600	7 = \$55,300	3 = \$23,700
ox 222/\$5,100	8 = \$ 40,800	4 = \$20,400	0
Fox Renard 41/\$4,150	12 = \$ 49,800	0 = 0	0
<b>Bass Clarinet</b>			
Buffet BC119320/\$8,100	1 = \$ 8,100	11 = \$89,100	5 = \$40,500
Yamaha YCL221-II/\$2,000	18 = \$ 36,000	10 = \$20,000	0
Selmer 1430LP/\$1,500	4 = \$ 6,000	0 = 0	0
<b>Tenor Saxophone</b>			
YamahaYTS62/\$2,800	0	5 = \$14,000	8 = \$22,400
Buffet BC840210/\$1,600	10 = \$ 16,000	5 = 8,000	7 = \$11,200
Buffet BC810110/\$ 700	0	8 = \$ 5,600	2 = \$ 1,400
<b>Baritone Saxophone</b>			
YamahaYBS52/\$4,500	1 = \$ 4,500	9 = \$40,500	1 = \$ 4,500
uffet BC840310/\$2,700	6 = \$ 16,200	5 = \$13,500	1 = \$ 2,700

**Cost estimates, p.2**

<b>INSTRUMENT/COST</b>	<b>NOW</b>	<b>1-5</b>	<b>6-10</b>
<b>French Horn</b>			
Conn 8D/\$3,300	34 = \$112,200	0	11 = \$36,300
Hans Hoyer 6802NSA-L/\$3,900	6 = \$ 23,400	0	9 = \$35,100
Yamaha YHR567/\$2,800	23 = \$ 64,400	8 = \$22,400	0
<b>Mellophone</b>			
King 1121 SP/\$1,400	0	20 = \$28,000	0
<b>Euphonium</b>			
Sterling Virtuoso/ \$6,000	3 = \$ 18,000	13 = \$78,000	2 = \$12,000
Yamaha YEP321s/\$2,000	35 = \$ 70,000	11 = \$22,000	0
<b>Marching Baritone</b>			
King 1124 SP/\$1,800	0	15 = \$27,000	0
<b>Tuba</b>			
Miraphone 1291BB/ \$10,000	3 = \$ 30,000	0	0
Miraphone 186S/\$8,000	13 = \$104,000	0	10 = \$80,000
King 2341W/\$4,700	9 = \$ 42,300	6 = \$28,200	3 = \$14,100
Jupiter 482L/\$3,000	20 = \$ 60,000	0 = 0	0 = 0
<b>Sousaphone</b>			
Conn 20KSBW/\$6,300	18 = \$113,400	0	0
<b>Specialty/Percussion</b>	0	\$150,00	\$200,000
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$957,700</b>	<b>\$714,000</b>	<b>\$539,100</b>